
<https://doi.org/10.15407/fd2020.05.041>
UDC 165

Olena LAZORENKO, Doctor of Philosophy,
President of NGO “League of Professional Women”,
Senior Research Fellow at the Department of Social Philosophy,
H.S. Skovoroda Institute of Philosophy,
National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine,
4, Triokhsviatytska St., Kyiv, 01001
lpw.network@gmail.com
<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9983-2840>

CIVIL SOCIETY AS DRIVER IN DEMOCRACY DISCOURSE OF ADULT LEARNING POLICY IN UKRAINE ¹

The article is focused on some aspects of development adult learning and education policy in Ukraine from stakeholders' perspective, and active role of the Ukrainian civil society in this discourse. This was facilitated by conducting analytical research and further advocacy activities on the protection and representation of interests in Ukraine in 2018-2019. Adult learning and education following the change in UNESCO's terminology from «adult education» to «adult learning and education» (abbreviated - ALE), is interpreted as a permanent activity aimed at acquiring, recognizing and applying key skills. Acquisition of new skills, abilities and knowledge by adults usually occurs after they receive basic education and enter the labour market. In European practice, this covers formal, non-formal and informal forms of adult learning. Stakeholders were involved in the analytical research through a survey of experts; participation in a practical seminar on peer review workshop, which was held in the format of a progress meeting to present the Policy Research Report and discuss the preliminary results; virtual discussion of analytical documents. Usually, adult learning policy promotes social well-being and integration, employment and active civil participation. Ukraine lack of consolidate active state adult learning policy during the whole period of its independence since 1991. The problem-solving options proposed in the research and validated by stakeholders are presented in this article. The article will be interesting for social philosophy, educational & learning academic and non-academic researchers, policy-makers and practitioners.

Keywords: Civil Society, Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine, Advocacy.

¹ EU & the International Renaissance Foundation within the framework of the Civic Synergy Project funded action research conducted in 2018 and national level advocacy activities until March 2019 in Ukraine; British Council Ukraine hosted the Peer Learning Workshop “Adult Learning Policy as Pathway to Implement European Integration of Ukraine & SDG #4”, 24 September 2018 in Kyiv. The article was written under the support of the author's UIL Research Scholarship at the UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL) in Hamburg, Germany in September 2019.

Citation: Lazorenko, O. (2020). Civil Society as Driver in Democracy Discourse of Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine. *Філософська думка*, 5, 41–59. <https://doi.org/10.15407/fd2020.05.041>

Introduction

This article describes the context of forming Ukraine's adult learning and education policy from the stakeholders' perspective. The modernization of Ukraine's social, economic and cultural sectors is partly dependent on development and introduction of a lifelong learning policy, with adult education and learning being essential; expanding the scope of education to include the engagement of adults in formal, non-formal and informal learning should help resolve the issues. Adult learning and education following the change in UNESCO's terminology from «adult education» to «adult learning and education» (abbreviated - ALE), is interpreted as a permanent activity aimed at acquiring, recognizing and applying key skills. Acquisition of new skills, abilities and knowledge by adults usually occurs after they receive basic education and enter the labour market.

At present, one of key challenges for Ukraine's development is lack of human resources with a level of competence that meets the modern requirements of the labour market. Five key problems that caused this lack of human resources in terms of quality and quantity include: natural ageing of population and demographic crisis; external labour migration; imbalance in the labour market, related to significant number of university-educated employees and lack of workers; level of modern competences of people aged 45+ is insufficient for their successful employment and active engagement in social life; lack of consolidate active state adult learning policy in Ukraine during the whole period of its independence.

The aims of the 2018 Policy research report were targeted at identified issues and proposed problem solving options for adult education and learning policy-makers in Ukraine. Objectives of the 2018 policy research report included: analysing key trends of adult education and learning development in Ukraine and in the EU within the defined time period; identifying Ukraine's international commitments in the field of adult education and learning; developing options for improvement of the state policy in this field and proposing an optimal course of action for its development.

Methodology used for the preparation of the 2018 Policy Research Report

The research framework, which I proposed for my co-author of the 2018 Policy Research Report, to conduct these four months study in Ukraine, combined following quality research methods. We used desk research² and experts' survey³ with

² During desk research analyzed the legal documents of Ukraine and the EU, official information of public authorities of Ukraine, official documents of the European Commission, bilateral bodies of association, state statistical information of Ukraine, EU statistics, as well as statistical and analytical information of international organizations, scientific and analytical sources, materials of periodicals, Internet search.

³ The expert survey conducted between April 21 and May 6, 2018 in Ukraine. The following communication channels were used to distribute the link to the questionnaire, which was available online: Internet websites, direct e-mail to experts and social networks (Facebook, LinkedIn). 18 people took part in the experts' survey (this number is relevant to this type of a survey, since it

the peer review stakeholders' workshop⁴. To take into account the position of stakeholders in the 2018 analytical study, we engaged relevant state actors (for example, state experts from the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine) and selected stakeholders (formal and non-formal adult learning providers, education experts) across Ukraine for some actions of Partnership. Stakeholders were involved in the study by took part in the expert survey created by authors and participated in the peer review workshop (24th September 2018 in Kyiv). The workshop involved a progress meeting to present the Policy Research Report and discuss the preliminary results. The outcomes of the workshop included stakeholder support of our problem solving options for new adult learning policy in Ukraine, as well as an update of the proposed recommendations for relevant public authorities in Ukraine in the field of adult education and learning.

Limitations of the 2018 Policy Research Report

Adult learning policy typically promotes social well-being and integration, employment and active civil participation. However, the present 2018 policy research report only focused on employment and labour market issues in modern Ukraine in the framework of lifelong learning activities. The 2018 policy research report not considered other components of lifelong learning, such as secondary, vocational (VET) education, and higher education. In addition, the report did not focus on the forms in which such types of education or learning may take place: dual education, inclusive education, distance education, mixed education, Massive Open Online Courses (MOOC), online learning and more.

The time periods of the 2018 policy research report included: *the period 1997 - April 2018 in Ukraine*⁵ (in 1997 the UNESCO Hamburg Declaration on Adult Learning with new commitments to the development of adult learning for participating countries (including Ukraine) was adopted; and *the period 2011 - April 2018 in the EU* (in 2011 the European Council adopted a resolution on the European Agenda for Adult Learning).

The geographical borders of the study are the territories of the EU and Ukraine during this time, with the exception of annexed Crimea and the temporarily occupied territories of Donetsk and Luhansk regions of Ukraine.

requires from 15 to 50 respondents). Among experts men make up 38.9% and women - 61.1%; where all have work experience in the adult learning & education sector in Ukraine, with 61.1% being more than 10 years and 22.2% having 5 to 10 years of experience. The results of the experts' survey in aggregated form given in Sections 5 and 6, Appendix 3 of the Policy Research Report "What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?" [In Ukrainian]. These results also supplemented and refined based on secondary sources of information and analysis of national and European data sources (analytical reports, results of sociological surveys, statistics).

⁴ Workshop's Brief on "Adult Learning Policy as Pathway to Implement European Integration of Ukraine & SDG #4" (in English): <http://lpw.org.ua/en/news/?pid=684>, Brief in Ukrainian: <http://lpw.org.ua/ua/news/?pid=684> Video of the peer review workshop, Kyiv, 24.09.2018: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=FpT-O4SZ4To>

⁵ Current article includes some comments on policy level changed in Ukraine until 30 October 2020.

Ukrainian and EU Context of the Policy Research Report: What are we talking about?

Ukraine profile. Ukraine is located in Eastern Europe and shares borders with Belarus, Poland, Slovakia, Hungary, Moldova, Romania and Russia.

Area: 603 700 km² (the biggest country in Europe); population: 45.4 million people (in 2016); official language: Ukrainian; Capital: Kyiv; Independence: August 24, 1991; Internal Displaced Persons (IDPs): 1 409 553 people according official data from the Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine (dated 16.09.2019).

Ukraine age structure. The largest percentage of Ukraine's population are adults: 0-14 years: 15.95% (male 3,609,386 /female 3,400,349); 15-24 years: 9.57% (male 2,156,338 /female 2,047,821); 25-54 years: 44.03% (male 9,522,108 /female 9,831,924); 55-64 years: 13.96% (male 2,638,173 /female 3,499,718); 65 years and over: 16.49% (male 2,433,718 /female 4,812,764) (2018 est.)⁶. Such age structure of Ukraine's population affects key issues in the development of a new national education policy, especially for adult learning, including strategy, legislation, action plans/roadmaps, policy research and more.

Main outlines of education policy in Ukraine

Since 2018, Ukrainian education in schools has been extended from 11 to 12 years. It now includes four years of elementary education, *five* years of middle school education, and three years of upper secondary (specialized) education. Main regulatory acts, which provide information about the current transition system of education in Ukraine, are: Law "On Higher Education" (№ 1556-VII, 01.07.2014); Law "On Research and Scientific Activity" (№ 848-VIII, 26.11.2015, updated version 16.10.2020); Law "On Education" (№ 2145-VIII, 05.09.2017); Law "On Pre-School Education" (№ 2628-III, 11.07.2001, updated version 20.05.2020); Law "On Full General Secondary Education" (№ 463-IX, 18.03.2020); Law "On Vocational Education" (№ 103/98-BP, 10.02.1998, updated version 20.05.2020).

Public expenditures go towards maintaining an extensive network of public education institutions covering preschool, general secondary, vocational, higher education and postgraduate education (*adult education is not an official term in Ukraine education's data*). Up to 6.0 percent of Ukraine's GDP public expenditure was on education in 2017. Of the 6.0 percent of GDP public expenditure on education in 2017, 47 percent went to general secondary schools, 22 percent to higher education institutions, 16 percent to preschools and other pre-primary education institutions, 5 percent to VET schools, and 1 percent to postgraduate education, as illustrated in Table 1.

⁶ CIA World Factbook. Ukraine age structure. Retrieved from: <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/resources/the-world-factbook/geos/up.html>.

Table 1. Distribution of public expenditures on education in Ukraine (2017)⁷

<i>Education systems</i>	<i>Labour</i>	<i>Non-labour</i>	<i>Capital expenditures</i>	<i>Total</i>
Preschool education system	10%	5%	1%	16%
General secondary education system	35%	8%	4%	47%
General secondary education system	3%	2%	0%	5%
Higher education	1%	19%	1%	22%
Postgraduate education system	1%	0%	0%	1%
Out-of-school education system	4%	1%	0%	4%
Material procurement programs	0%	0%	0%	0%
R&D in education	0%	1%	0%	1%
Other	2%	2%	0%	4%
	55%	37%	8%	100%

Therefore, adult learning policy is not widely considered in Ukrainian education policy. Education research emerges rather from fields relating to lifelong learning, education and professional development. At present, adult learning issues are related to/or are included in various national target state programmes. For example, “Issuing vouchers⁸for maintaining the competitiveness in the labour market”, 2013 (responsibility until September 2019 by the Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine and the State Employment Service); the State Social Programme on Equal Rights and Opportunities of Women and Men for the period up to 2021 (according Section 2 of the regional state administrations, Kyiv city state administrations, the Ministry of Social Policy are responsible for training component), etc.

The Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine, along with other stakeholders, only started drafting the first Law of Ukraine on Adult Education (AE) in 2017; these activities continue in 2019-2020. New legislation regulation and state policy on adult education and learning in Ukraine is needed for several reasons: the age structure of a population affects a nation’s key socioeconomic issues; Ukraine population structure (with a dominant proportion of adults); modernization of the social, economic and cultural sectors in Ukraine; expanding the scope of education through engagement of adults in formal, non-formal and informal learning; global trends in the development of a digital economy and learning society.

What is adult learning policy according to the 2018 Policy Research Report? An active lifelong learning policy should include both adult learning and education,

⁷ Source: Ukraine BOOST 2017 based on data from State Treasury Service - Quote by the World Bank. 2018. Ukraine Education Policy Note: Introducing the New Ukrainian School in a Fiscally Sustainable Manner. The World Bank, Washington, DC. p. 9.

⁸ A vouchers programme is financial aid for education and training courses. The vouchers are free training/ learning courses for people’s orders than 45 years, which have minimum 15 year of employment insurance payment in Ukraine and learning needs.

and improve the situation, reducing the negative impact of the said problem such as lack of human resources in terms of quality and quantity. Adult learning should be understood as using all modality of knowledge acquisition, combining formal education and learning (formal, non-formal and informal) at all levels. Such an approach allows adults with completed formal education to acquire new competences or to improve their expertise and skills.

Adult education and learning policy in Ukraine should have primary beneficiaries such as: (a) young women and man, middle-aged and senior people with learning needs; (b) employers; (c) public authorities interested in highlighting their pool of human resources, boost talent ship and potential performance outcomes and with adults who are able to work, ensuring their inclusion in the community's social and economic life (consolidated territorial communities, local self-government bodies).

Relevant modern EU context

The European approach⁹ is characterized by: the existence of sustainable adult learning policy as a component of lifelong learning; key lifelong learning competences, updated in 2018, which are a universal reference for any EU member state in developing its adult learning and education policy; systemic support for the adult learning sector: from qualitative and quantitative studies, statistics collection (financed by the EU and/or EU member states) and sharing best practices for the innovation and financing of learning and advance learning for individual adults.

Ensuring equal opportunity issues for women and man

More broadly and paying attention to equal opportunities between men and women in terms of access to all forms of adult learning, most Ukrainian adult learning experts consider the development of a national policy focused on gender equality promotion in Ukraine as important and necessary. These experts also recommend the implementation of interim special measures (i.e. quotas, fixed ratios etc. for the less represented sex)¹⁰ during both the implementation and development phases of the adult learning policy.

⁹ See: European Union (2011). Official Journal of the European Union: Council Resolution on a renewed European agenda for adult learning. Retrieved from: http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=uriserv:OJ.C_.2011.372.01.0001.01.ENG; Communication from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions (2007). Action Plan on Adult learning - It is always a good time to learn. Retrieved from: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A52007DC0558>; European Commission (2015): Study on the analysis of adult learning policies and their effectiveness in Europe //An in-depth analysis of adult learning policies and their effectiveness in Europe, Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion Directorate C (Europe 2020: Employment Policies), Unit 5 (Vocational Training and Adult Education), 2015; European Commission (2018). Proposal for a Council Recommendation on Key Competences for Lifelong Learning, 2018/0008 (NLE). Retrieved from: <https://ec.europa.eu/education/sites/education/files/recommendation-key-competences-lifelong-learning.pdf>; etc.

¹⁰ See: Olena Lazorenko, Rodion Kolisko. Policy Research Report "What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?" Kyiv: "Sinergy Project", 2018. [In Ukrainian]; Olena Lazorenko,

To summarize, the rationale of the new adult learning and education policy in Ukraine will cover the promotion of employment and decent working conditions (which is the focus of the current policy research report), as well as social well-being & integration, and active civil participation for all.

This national level policy is to serve as a basic reference for the policy design, implementation, and monitoring for the provision of local (regional /"oblast" level) adult learning and education policies (include formal, non-formal and informal learning) as an integral component of decentralization reform in Ukraine.

Discussion / Problem Solving Options

The co-authors¹¹ the 2018 Policy Research Report propose described below three problem solving options.

Option 1. "Campaign for raising awareness of adult education"

Tool: dissemination of information from the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (MESU), Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine¹², State Labour Service of Ukraine, local self-government bodies with the help of subordinate bodies and institutions. Additionally, CSOs should provide information about the benefit of modern competencies of adults of different age categories (especially persons of age category "45+"), with training given by its providers. Most of these providers are now funded by international technical assistance, private or in-house learners, and have limited target groups (for example, socially vulnerable people: IDPs, rural population or marginalized groups, etc.) of their own activity. The option does not envisage the implementation of separate measures and funding at the central level of the relevant executive authorities, but only focuses on the additional use of existing communication and marketing capabilities of central, regional, local education and employment services.

Furthermore, a similar option is usually (for example, in Germany) funded locally, where free courses are provided for adults. Such courses can cover a wide range of topics, which are determined by the needs of the local labour market, civic education and other initial requirements of local residents.

Rodion Kolishko. Brief Policy Research Report "What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?" (in English), 2019. Retrieved from: <https://www.civic-synergy.org.ua/en/analyt-ics/what-adult-learning-policy-should-be-in-ukraine/>

¹¹ See: Olena Lazorenko, Rodion Kolisko. Policy Research Report "What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?" Kyiv: "Sinergy Project", 2018. pp. 30-34. [In Ukrainian]

¹² The Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine less the functions on professional development and adult learning in area of employment competences, according redistribution of relevant powers and functions of central executive bodies. Accordingly, the State Labor Service of Ukraine will pass control of the Ministry for Economic Development, Trade and Agriculture of Ukraine by the Resolution on the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Agriculture, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine on September 11, 2019. No. 838 and September 18, 2019. News of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine. Retrieved from: <https://www.kmu.gov.ua/ua/news/kabinet-ministriv-na-svoyemu-zasidanni-prijnyav-nizku-vazhlyviv-rishen>.

How it will affect the cause of the problem. For all of the reasons stated in the introduction, this option will partially affect the cause # 4 “The level of knowledge and skills of people of 45+ age category that is not sufficient for successful employment and active participation in public life. The impact will be due to a certain increase in the number of applications from representatives of the specified age category to the education system and employment services with the aim of improving their educational and / or qualification levels through the passage of professional development and training. Additional validation of non-formal and informal learning outcomes may be possible.

Origin: comes from own initiative of central executive bodies (MESU, Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine) and local self-government bodies.

Form: information campaign, dissemination of information through institutions and branches of the Pension Fund of Ukraine, State Labour Service of Ukraine, websites of these institutions, local self-government bodies of other stakeholders (international technical assistance programs, CSOs, etc.).

Target group to which the tool can be applied in Ukraine: Adults aged 25-64 who have learning needs and are included in the target groups of the campaign (if we take the age range as adopted in the EU Adult Education Survey) or 15-70 years old (as it is now presented in statistics data in Ukraine).

Impact of the tool in Ukraine: The instrument is of limited use in Ukraine, related to financing provided by DVV International Ukraine.

In which country this tool was successfully used: Germany (“People’s Universities, Volksschule”, provider - DVV International).

Option 2. “Extended Voucher” provides an adult learning component in current state targeted programs: voucher, trainings for civil servants, teachers' trainings, etc. This option allows the use of the following tools.

2.1. Tool “Voucher”

Developing and implementing state and local government instruments to support citizens of Ukraine (age category 45+, promoting gender equality), aimed at offsetting (full or partial) the costs of training and / or professional development in particular professions new competencies. The “Voucher tool” is being implemented in the Cabinet Ministries of Ukraine programme on “Issuing Vouchers for Maintaining the Competitiveness of Persons in the Labour Market”¹³ from 2013. The purpose of the programme is to allocate and distribute a portion of budgetary funds among citizens of the specified age category, directing these funds specifically to offset the cost of training and / or refresher training on specific criteria (including age, purpose, training, importance of knowledge and skills for the individual / state, etc.).

Form: set of normative acts and actions of state authorities (MESU, Ministry of Social Policy), local self-government, educational service providers, centres of

¹³ The Cabinet Ministries of Ukraine Resolution No. 207 of March 20, 2013 “On Approving the Procedure for Issuing Vouchers to Maintain the Competitiveness of Individuals in the Labor Market”. [In Ukrainian]. Retrieved from: <http://zakon5.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/207-2013-%D0%BF>

confirmation of results of training, training centres on allocation, distribution and use of budgetary funds, provision of educational services, etc.

Target group to which the tool is applied in Ukraine: Adults of certain social groups (e.g., unemployed) and professions of age category “45+”.

In which country the tool was used: Poland, Ukraine (vouchers for adult education in priority professions / competences).

Impact of the tool in Ukraine: The results of the state monitoring (the tool has been in place since 2013) and the impact of the designated instrument in Ukraine to improve the situation / or address the target group have failed to find in public access. Among the limitations / disadvantages of this tool in Ukraine, in the authors' of the Policy Research Report opinion, there are: (1) weak link between certain professions for which the voucher is issued, in relation to the needs of the labour market and its very rapid changes in regional dynamics; (2) poor use of prognostic methods for assessing employers' needs in determining training priorities; (3) lack of equality of access for providers of formal and non-formal adult education (especially for those with a private ownership and CSOs) to obtain funding, that is, to compensate for the cost of adult education on the voucher.

2.2. Tool “trainings for civil servants on gender issues”

The adult learning component in the national targeted programs is present in the State Social Program for Equal Rights and Opportunities for Women and Men for the period up to 2021 in Ukraine (hereinafter - the Equal Rights Program), approved by the CMU on 5.04.2018. Policy Issues on Adult Gender Policy are addressed in Section II. “Improving the Professional Level of Civil Servants and Officials of Local Self-Government on Ensuring Equal Rights and Opportunities for Women and Men” (see Section 5 of this document for details). This is directly relevant to Measures (1), (2) and (3) in “Task # 5. Reducing Gender Imbalance in Public Service and Human Resources Management” and “Task # 6. Introducing training courses for civil servants and local self-government officials into training programs on equal rights and opportunities for women and men”.

Form: State equal rights program, tasks and measures for implementation of the state equal rights program, the monitoring of the program will be carried out according to the indicators given in the “Expected Program Results”. State customer and coordinator of the Equal Rights Programme: Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine, Chief Budget Officer and executors of Equal Rights Program in the field of training civil servants - oblast, Kyiv City State Administrations of local self-government bodies (TBC), National Academy of Public Administration under the President of Ukraine (with consent), NADS of the Ministry of Social Policy, MESU, other central executive bodies, public associations and international organizations (TBC).

The source of financing measures (1), (2) identifies the local budget, according to which it is planned to allocate 1318 thousand UAH¹⁴ for these purposes from 2018

¹⁴ 1 318 000 UAH is about 47 308 Euro and 400 000 UAH is about 14 358 Euro by the course of the National Bank of Ukraine on 30 of October 2019.

to 2021 and to attract 400 thousand UAH (for Events (2)) - from other sources. In total, 300 training programmes/initiatives are planned for 9,000 people in the period 2018–2021, with participation monitoring for gender-disaggregated indicators.

Target group to which the tool is applied in Ukraine: civil servants and officials of local self-government bodies.

In which country it was used: Ukraine and the EU. The EU is using a more extensive program called “Strategy for Equality between Women and Men for 2010–2015” and “Strategy for the Implementation of Gender Equality for 2016–2019”, adopted in December 2015.

Impact of the Tool (Instrument) in Ukraine: The Instrument in Ukraine has just come into effect (11.04.2018), so the evaluation and monitoring period has not yet come.

2.3. Tool: Teachers' Trainings on Human Rights

Developed by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (MESU) in January 2018, the draft National Human Rights Education Program has an adult learning component. “Teachers’ Training” - provided in Section 5.5. “Training and Professional Growth of School Staff” of the draft Concept of the National Program on Human Rights Education (hereinafter referred to as the “Concept of the State Program”), which was undergoing a public consultation process during the period 24.01.2018–23.02.2018. The draft State Program Concept was developed by MESU to ensure consistent implementation of the human rights education strategy based on a systematic (consistent, planning and management) approach. National Human Rights Strategy and Action Plan approved in 2015¹⁵.

How it will affect the cause of the problem: it should have a positive effect on the causes # 3–4 and partially on cause # 2, as it will allow the selected category of citizens of Ukraine without additional financial expenses (or significantly reducing them) to gain additional benefits for work in primary and secondary school. The school lacks a defined and systematic policy on the training and education on human rights pedagogical staff.

Form: draft Concept of the State Programme.

Target group to which the tool is applied in Ukraine: elementary and secondary school staff.

In which country is it used: Ukraine (planned), World practice (World Human Rights Education Program. United National General Assemble Resolution 59.113 from 14 July 2005).

Impact of the tool in Ukraine: While the content of the proposed draft Human Rights Education Programme has not been analysed, we will point out some of the

¹⁵ Presidential Decree of 25.08.2015 “On Approval of the National Strategy on Human Rights”. The official portal of the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine. <http://rada.gov.ua/> [In Ukrainian] <http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/501/2015>; Cabinet Ministry of Ukraine’s (CMU) Order dated 23.11.2015 No. 1393-p “On Approval of the Action Plan for the Implementation of the National Human Rights Strategy for the Period up to 2020”. CMU Orders - Government Portal. [In Ukrainian] <http://www.kmu.gov.ua/control/uk/cardnpd?docid=248740679>.

shortcomings of the draft document in terms of formal, non-formal and informal adult learning. (1) The results of the public consultation process are not made public on the website (as of 16.05.2018) for public and the experts' communities, unlike the practice of the EU or international institutions. (2) The draft Human Rights Education Programme does not envisage equality access for providers of formal and non-formal adult education in this component: only participation of higher education institutions are envisaged (in bachelor / masters courses generally related to the higher education segment, and is not covered adult learning) and the creation of communities of practitioners (this is a segment of informal adult learning).

Option 3. "Relevant changes in adult education and learning policy"

Tool: design, implementation, evaluation and monitoring policy on adult learning as part of lifelong learning person, regardless of age, social status, gender which allows at any time from / job training / work acquire additional knowledge, skills (or increase / confirm existing professional level) or civic competences. When developing a concept, strategy, and action plan, for example, it is possible to use the "Analytical framework"¹⁶ (developed by Vocational Training and Adult Education of EC in 2015) and provide in Table 2. The analytical framework outlined in the Table includes a detailed picture of the elements identified as important for effective adult learning and demonstrating their relationships. It illustrates how specific adult learning measures can be seen as "constructive elements" for successful policies; contributes to the achievement of six key factors for success; illustrates how these policy actions ensure the effectiveness of adult learning; takes into account those indicators that indicate an increase in participation in training; shows the different implications of this policy; and groups that benefit from these adult learning outcomes, namely, learners, employers, and communities.

This "Analytical framework" can be used as a template to guide the development, analysis, evaluation and monitoring of adult learning strategies regionally, nationally or internationally.

The proposed Option 3 should combine the positive experiences outlined in Option 2 "Extended Voucher", which provides an adult learning component in government targeted programs (voucher, civil servants training, teacher trainings, etc.), as well as information support elements for education and training policies for adults described in Option 1 "Adult education awareness raising campaign".

How it will affect the cause of the problem: Positive impact on problems # 2-4-5 (described in the introduction), when any adult in the most flexible way and with the ability to compensate for the costs (all or part) may receive additional knowledge or to enhance existing knowledge and skills, both in Ukraine and abroad (on

¹⁶ European Commission (2015): Study on the analysis of adult learning policies and their effectiveness in Europe//An in-depth analysis of adult learning policies and their effectiveness in Europe, Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion Directorate C (Europe 2020: Employment Policies), Unit 5 (Vocational Training and Adult Education), 2015 - p. 156.

Table 2. Template: Analytical framework for adult learning policy¹

Key success factors	Building blocks for success				System level indicator	Outcomes
	1.1: Raise awareness of benefits of learning	1.2: Provide guidance on learning options	1.3: Engage social partners	1.4: Ensure good initial learning experience		
1. Learners' interest in learning					1: Participation in learning	For individuals: -increased income -Improved wellbeing - increased employability
2. Em-ployers investment in learning	2.1 Financial incentives for employers	2.2: Promote accredited qualifications	2.3: Promote work-based learning			
3. Improve equality of access for all	3.1. Fund learning for disadvantaged groups	3.2. Provide targeted guidance and support	3.3. Recognize prior learning	3.4. Outreach via a range of organization	2. Skills and competences	For employers: -motivate workforce -productivity -innovation
4. Learning that is relevant	4.1. Understand learning needs	4.2. Forecast employee 'skills needs	4.3: Promote innovation and flexibility	4.4. Provide progression pathways		
5. High quality learning	5.1. Monitoring and evaluation	5.2. Develop skilled adult education workforce			3. Outcomes of learning	For community: -economic growth -civic and social participation -greater equality
6. Coherent policy	6.1. Co-ordinate with other policies	6.2. Align policy at local level	6.3. Build knowledge base			

¹ This template also available online at EPALE portal page on "Achieving effective adult learning policies - Key success factors" <https://ec.europa.eu/epale/en/policy-tool/key-success-factors>.

a grant or credit basis). The need for external “educational” migration at a young age is reduced; developing a system of motivation and communication for middle-aged and older adults for lifelong learning. The means of modern distance and e-learning are widely used, including mass open online courses (abbreviated as MOOC). The capacity of state and communal educational institutions is being expanded by organizing evening and “day off” classes as well as on-the-job training or internships. Introducing equality of access for providers of formal and non-formal adult learning and recognition in the National Qualifications Framework of the results of non-formal and informal learning.

Form: system of action of public authorities, educational service providers, citizens of Ukraine, banking institutions and employers, oriented to the promotion, stimulation and provision of continuous lifelong learning. The most active element of the system should be the person.

Target group to which the tool applies: Adults with learning needs, employers and communities.

In which country is successfully used: EU. Lifelong Learning policies, such as the European Adult Learning Agenda, make adult learning an integral and essential element of this policy, aimed at providing learning opportunities for all adults throughout their active life.

What impact the tool can have in Ukraine: Developing and implementing adult learning policies for learners, employers and the public in Ukraine can have a positive impact in the future.

To summarize, we (2018 policy research report’s authors and representatives of Ukrainian stakeholders¹⁷) believe that the most efficient option for Ukraine is “Option 3 — relevant changes in adult education and learning policy”, because implementation of this option will: firstly, allow for systemic and predictable engagement of additional human resources in Ukraine’s labour market; secondly, address the problem of social inclusion of adults in the social and economic life of the state and the society; thirdly, provide an additional impetus to development of education/ learning providers; fourthly, create conditions for development of andragogy as a science discipline that ensures methodological support for adult education and learning in Ukraine.

The contribution of civil society for beginning change in legislation on adult learning in Ukraine

In 2018 started up advocacy activities by “Partnership on Adult Learning” (Partnership) to achieve change in Ukraine’s adult learning policy. Advocacy activities initiated by leaders of two NGOs — League of Professional Women (LPW) and Ins-

¹⁷ Problem solving options and recommendations were discussed with stakeholders, which included civil society civil society experts and formal and non-formal learning providers from Kyiv, Lviv, Zhytomyr, Khmelnytsky, Bakhmat, Kremenchug, who are members of the Working Groups of the Ukrainian side of the EU-Ukraine Civil Society Platform and government representatives, during a peer- learning workshop on September 24, 2018 in Kyiv.

titude of Professional Qualifications (IPQ), both NGOs are members of the working groups of Ukrainian side of the EU-Ukraine Civil Society Platform. We engage relevant state actors (deputy ministry, state experts from the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine) and donors (EU & the International Renaissance Foundation within the framework of the Civic Synergy Project). This support finished in March 2019. Currently ongoing fundraising for increase the scope of the members of Partnership and its outcome. We aim to collaborate with a network of experts to advance national, regional, international and thematic policy dialogue between civil society and relevant policy-makers, stakeholders with focus on adult education and learning.

Partnership is led by Ukrainian NGO “League of Professional Women” (LPW). LPW is a Ukrainian non-governmental, non-profit organization which was set up in 1997. LPW head office is based in Kyiv, Ukraine and the LPW network has representatives in other regions of Ukraine. LPW unites representatives of business, science, education, mass media and public spheres. The LPW promotes the active role of women in the economic and society’s life of Ukraine, through networking, informational & cultural support, learning and professional development.

Partnership start-up advocacy began to achieve change in legislation in Ukraine with focus on drafting Law of Ukraine on Adult Education that have been developed by the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine with assist of stakeholders since 2017. I participated in developing the Law’s draft as public expert¹⁸ from July 2018 to March 2019 and from June to October 2020. In the summary of my input on drafting Law of Ukraine on Adult Education (AE), I’d like focus on the following actions, all its output conducted in Ukraine. *Action 1*: joint to the expert working group under the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (MESU) on drafting Law on Adult Education (prescript by MESU from № 796, 20.07.2018). *Action 2*: present to policy makers Policy Report “What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?” in November 2018. Result: Letter from MESU 6.12.2018 about advising assistance on drafting Law on Adult Education in Ukraine. *Action 3*: verbal and writing consultations/negotiation of the public experts with state actors on drafting Law of Ukraine on Adult Education (including new Policy paper “Advising assistance on drafting Law on Adult Education in Ukraine”¹⁹ in December 14, 2018; and its consolidated version dated February 20, 2019. *Action 4*: review drafting Law on AE in Ukraine by members of the MESU’s working group (in November 2018, January 2019, March 2019, and October 2020).

In the introduction, which started our policy paper “Advising assistance on drafting Law on Adult Education in Ukraine”, I described the background documents for this policy paper; there are: the European Agenda for Adult Learning

¹⁸ I’m President of NGO “League of Professional Women”, see more: <http://lpw.org.ua>, Facebook: <https://www.facebook.com/LPWUA/>

¹⁹ Olena Lazorenko, Rodion Kolishko (2019). Policy paper “Advising assist on drafting Law on Adult Education in Ukraine” [In Ukrainian] http://lpw.org.ua/ua/adult_education/researches_on_AE/Analytical_note_20-02-2019/

(2011 EAAL); 2016 UNESCO Global Report on Adult Learning and Education (GRALE III); SDG #4; 2015 UNESCO Recommendation on Adult Learning and Education; selected new offers from European and Ukrainian experts on the subject.

In addition, we noted, that the framework Law of Ukraine “On Education” (05.09.2017) included the current definition and understanding of the term “adult education”. Thus, Article 10 of the Law on Education states that adult education, including postgraduate education, is an integral part of education. This component is revealed in Art. 19 of the Law on Education and has the following components: postgraduate education; professional training of employees; retraining and / or advanced training courses; continuous professional development; any other elements provided by law, proposed by the educational entity or self-identified.

Now, it can be argued that, despite the lack of comprehensive legislative regulation of the adult education and learning area, some of its elements include: “professional training of employees” and “non-formal vocational training of employees”; a voucher to maintain the competitiveness of individuals in the labour market; the preparation, retraining and refresher training of the unemployed, taking into account the current and perspective needs of the labour market, carried out by the Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine and the State Labour Service, are regulated at different levels of regulations.

Comprehensive regulation of the adult education and learning area is to be addressed by the relevant Law with the working title “Adult Education”, which is developed by the experts’ working group under the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine (MESU). Due to the limited volume of this Article, I will not now argue the positive and problematic aspects of this draft Law in the 2018 edition, which our analytical materials in Ukrainian and speeches are devoted to.

On the base of currently available information, public consultation conducted for this draft of Law on Adult Education in Ukraine.

Key findings of the 2018 policy research report

The findings of the study carried out suggest that relevant public authorities in Ukraine pay some attention to the problem of adult education and learning policy-making and implementation.

While summarizing stakeholders groups’ expectations with regard to development and implementation of adult education and learning policy in Ukraine, it is important to note the following: there are no stakeholder groups arguing against it; there is a high potential demand for learning providers’ services related to adult learning in Ukraine; education and learning providers in Ukraine, as well as some groups of adults, show interest in the development and implementation of adult education and learning policy in Ukraine.

A number of international commitments in the field of education, including adult learning, are important for Ukraine. The most relevant commitments include: UNESCO’s Incheon Declaration (2015) and UNESCO’s Hamburg Dec-

laration (1997); Sustainable Development Goals till 2030; Eastern Partnership Deliverables for 2020; EU-Ukraine Association Agreement; a number of bilateral and multilateral international agreements, to which Ukraine is a party; around 20 bilateral and multilateral international agreements dealing with some issues in the field of adult learning and education.

The EU context is the most important for the development of adult education and learning policy in Ukraine, and it is characterized by: existence of sustainable adult learning policy as a component of lifelong learning; key lifelong learning competences, updated in 2018, which are universal reference for any EU member state in development of its adult learning and education policy; systemic support for the adult learning sector: from qualitative and quantitative studies, statistics collection (financed by the EU and/or EU member states) and sharing best practices to innovation and financing of learning and advance learning for individual adults.

In consideration of the foregoing, the absence of any consolidated concept, strategy and relevant legal framework for the development of adult education and learning policy is the most visible issue in Ukraine. The existing regulation of adult learning tools, including vouchers for support of competitiveness in the labour market, makes it even worse as it is not a part of the general comprehensive policy for adults, which would promote full and productive employment and support competitiveness of adults in the labour market.

Authors proposed the following three problem solving options: “Adult education awareness raising campaign”, “Enhanced Voucher” and “Relevant changes in adult education and learning policy”. Authors and stakeholders choose the third option – relevant changes in adult education and learning policy.

The process of development of the strategy in 2019 must involve responsible policy-makers and stakeholders of all levels: executive and legislative authorities, All-Ukrainian and local, and also a civil society represented by nongovernment organizations.

Based on the conducted analysis in 2018, we recommend that Ukrainian public authorities, which are duly engaged in developing, assessing and monitoring the national adult learning policy, take targeted actions. Recipients of the strategic orientations included (all titles of Ukrainian public institutions provides in edition that they have until September 2019): Parliament of Ukraine, Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine, Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine, Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine, Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine & Ministry of Culture and Tourism of Ukraine.

The Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine (Parliament of Ukraine) and respective committees: initiate drafting of the Law of Ukraine on Adult Education and Learning; initiate parliamentary hearings on adult learning and education in Ukraine; facilitate accelerated drafting of the Law before the first and second readings; assign drafting of the Law on Adult Education and Learning to the Verkhovna Rada Committee on Science and Education.

Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine: involve different stakeholders in public consultations on adult learning and education. Based on the experience of the League of Professional Women in localizations SDGs 2030 for Ukraine, it is extremely important to join efforts of government agencies, academic institutions, NGOs, private business initiatives and citizen proposals during public consultation; implement the currently worldwide policy-making principles and tools: Government authorities should organize public interactions introducing consequently deliberative democracy principles. In addition, we support the concept of public consultations that would be open to all stakeholders in this matter: It would very valuable to conduct expert roundtable discussions and workshops to ensure in-depth analysis of questions and create an open space for public debate; establish a governance body, in charge through coordination of developing, implementing, evaluating and monitoring the state adult learning policy in Ukraine; provide relevant sources of funding and human resources to ensure proper performance of the governance body as described above; develop necessary legal framework for local self-government bodies and amalgamated territorial communities in order to promote the necessary implementation of the adult education and learning activities at the most local level for a person; such action would furthermore respect the subsidiarity principle linked to the general decentralization policy in Ukraine.

Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine: advance drafting the Law of Ukraine on “Adult Education” to drafting the Law of Ukraine on “Adult Education and Learning” and make it open for public discussion; initiate the development of the Green Paper and the White Paper of the state adult education and learning policy; draft the Concept of state adult education and learning policy and make it open for public discussion; introduce and adhere to the principle of equality of formal and non-formal adult learning providers in all state policy documents; make sure the Strategic Action Plan allows the Ministry to delegate to stakeholders the drawing up of adult education and learning guidelines, teaching materials, and in parallel to allocate necessary resources; include the andragogy as a practise to be developed by the state order for training specialists, academics, education and research staff, labour force, for advanced training and retraining of personnel; develop (in partnership with stakeholders) guidelines for secondary schools, vocational training schools and higher education institutions interested in providing adult education and learning services; implement the non-formal and informal adult learning outcomes within the National Qualifications Framework.

Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine: develop and introduce amendments to the Law of Ukraine on Employment aiming at expanding employment opportunities for adult population; expand the list of occupations that require confirmation of non-formal vocational training results; ensure development of professional standards, self-assessment questionnaires, and lists of measurement tools and non-formal vocational training evaluation criteria that will be used to approve professional certification; develop and introduce amendments to applicable laws referring to requirements that should be taken into account to validate non-formal

vocational training results for all occupations; professional standards should be developed and agreed with relevant stakeholders; set up within the Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine a devoted department responsible of overseeing problems related to the use of adult learning tools in Ukraine and addressing adult employment; ensure that the State Employment Service is duly engaged in adult professional orientation, training and job placement.

Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine: revise its estimation of human resources potential taking into account a broader involvement of adults in economic scene; revise formal and non-formal employment indicators; consider proposals made by the central executive authorities regarding the State order for adult training of specialists, academics, education and research staff, labour force, for advanced training and retraining of adult personnel; ensure that adult education and learning is coordinated and included into the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals 2030 (SDG4) and submitted to the United Nations Voluntary National Review (VNR) of Ukraine on SDGs 2030 implementation; all these outputs should be developed with all relevant stakeholders.

Ministry of Culture of Information Policy of Ukraine: ensure that the Action Plans will deal with addressing issues related to the support of adult education and learning in cultural institutions that are subordinated to this Ministry; develop a series of national contests involving the adult population of Ukraine and aiming to promote the historical and cultural heritage of Ukraine that should be preserved and maintained.

Conclusions

Overall, I describe the input of this Policy Research Report through its communication and dissemination, which was conducted within the framework of our Ukrainian NGO “League of Professional Women” (LPW) and “Partnership on Adult Learning” in the national and international levels.

Conducted presentation at EU-EaP Conference on Promoting Common Values through Education and Culture that took place in Tbilisi, Georgia in 25-26 June 2019. Online check “Olena Lazorenko: Learning and democratic participation: Ukrainian case of engagement in adult learning policy development”²⁰.

Presented in Kyiv to state experts and decision-makers of the Policy Research Report “What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?” in November 2018, in the office of the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine²¹.

Submitted case study on the base of key findings of the Report to 2019 UN Regional Forum on Sustainable Development for the UNECE region (March 2019).

²⁰ See: Presentation by Dr. Olena Lazorenko, “Learning and democratic participation: Ukrainian case of engagement in adult learning policy development”. June 25, 2019. Retrieved from: <https://ec.europa.eu/assets/eac/education/documents/eastern-partnership/11-session-democratic-participation-lazorenko.pdf>.

²¹ Output of this presentation: the Letter from the Ministry of Education and Sciences of Ukraine dated 6.12.2018 about requested advisers’ assistance from our research team on drafting Law on Adult Education in Ukraine.

Published (after peer review) in July 2019 at the official web-portal of 2019 UN High-Level Political Forum for Sustainable Development (HLPF) under the auspices of the Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) new study “ League of Professional Women - Para 89 - HLPF 2019\Inputs to the High-level Political Forum on Sustainable Development. USA, New York, 2019 has reference links to the Policy Research Report.

Conducted presentation on “Improving Adult Learning and Education Policy: Ukraine in European Context” at UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL) in Hamburg, Germany in September 24, 2019.

To summarize, follow-up activities (in case of receive relevant support) from civil society’s and public experts perspective will be focused on, but not limited to: providing guidance for the legislation, advice in development state strategic plans and voluntary obligations required by all service providers and potential service providers in the provision of different forms of adult learning and education; assisting in the integration of adult learning and education policy with Ukrainian general education policy; providing assistance in the implementation and monitoring of Recognition, Validation and Accreditation (RVA); assisting in the development of special measures to promote adult learning for women, especially in the ages 45+; support the creation of a learning environment in cities across Ukraine.

REFERENCES

- European Union (2011). *Official Journal of the European Union: Council Resolution on a renewed European agenda for adult learning*. Retrieved from: http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=uriserv:OJ.C_.2011.372.01.0001.01.ENG
- European Commission (2015). *Study on the analysis of adult learning policies and their effectiveness in Europe*. In: An in-depth analysis of adult learning policies and their effectiveness in Europe, Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion Directorate C (Europe 2020: Employment Policies), Unit 5 (Vocational Training and Adult Education).
- UNESCO (2015). *UNESCO Recommendation on Adult Learning and Education*. UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning (UIL), Hamburg, UIL. Retrieved from: <http://uil.unesco.org/adult-education/unesco-recommendation/unesco-recommendation-adult-learning-and-education-2015>
- Lazorenko, O., Kolishko, R. (2018). *Policy Research Report “What Should Be the Adult Learning Policy in Ukraine?”*. Kyiv: Civil Sinergy Project. [In Ukrainian]. Retrieved from: http://lpw.org.ua/ua/adult_education/researches_on_AE/Adult_Learnng_2018/ and <https://www.civic-synergy.org.ua/analytics/yakoyu-maye-buty-polityka-navchannya-doroslyh-v-ukrayini/>
- Peer Learning Workshop “Adult Learning Policy as Pathway to Implement European Integration of Ukraine & SDG #4”. Kyiv, Ukraine 24 September 2018. Retrieved from: <http://lpw.org.ua/en/news/?pid=684> and <http://www.act4sdgs.org/partner/lpw2018>
- Lazorenko, O., Kolishko, R. (2019). *Policy Research Report Brief. What adult learning policy should be in Ukraine?* Kyiv: Civil Sinergy Project. Retrieved from: <https://www.civic-synergy.org.ua/en/analytics/what-adult-learning-policy-should-be-in-ukraine/>
- League of Professional Women (2019). *Para 89 - HLPF 2019/ Inputs to the High-level Political Forum on Sustainable Development*. USA, New York. Retrieved from: <https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/index.php?page=view&type=30022&nr=2250&menu=3170>

Received 05.10.2020